**From:**Paul Warren (Economy Transport and Environment)
**Sent:**5 May 2021 20:59:03 +0100
**To:**Development
**Cc:**Anthony, Laura
**Subject:**AVA/2021/0280 and AVA/2021/0281 The Black Swan Wirksworth Road Idridgehay

Dear Laura

**AVA/2021/0280**

**Construction of a modest, single storey extension to The Black Swan Public House and Restaurant to form a snug bar**

**The Black Swan Wirksworth Road Idridgehay Belper Derbyshire DE56 2SG**

and

**AVA/2021/0281**

**Listed building consent for construction of a modest, single storey extension to The Black Swan Public House and Restaurant to form a snug bar**

**The Black Swan Wirksworth Road Idridgehay Belper Derbyshire DE56 2SG**



Please find below my heritage comments on this application:

**Context**

This early 19th century building is listed in grade II and located within the Idridgehay Conservation Area. Its assertive siting and presence, against the Wirksworth Road, is strengthened by it being the dominant main historic element of the building group, to define its essential character. The former coaching inn has a distinctive symmetrical frontage, with a collection of elements that contribute to its architectural composition and that distinctive character. These include, amongst others, its subtle, two-storey canted bays, flanking the central canopied entrance, under its deep overhanging eaves, its distinctive iron windows, with gothic intersecting glazing bars. It is regrettable that the hand-painted signage over the ground floor bay window openings has been painted out, as it will have contributed to the overall of impressed memory of the building, for those that have experienced it in passing, over many generations.

Under recent approvals (AVA/2018/0280 and -/0281), additional accommodation has cumulatively increased the operational area of the building to a significant scale, at the rear, as a percentage of the original footprint and volume. The planning authority has demonstrated a flexible and supportive approach to the use of the building, despite its duty to preserve the special interest of the listed building.

**Proposed Development**

The proposed development includes a single-storey front extension, to be used as a re-positioned snug drinking area, separated from the main dining area, with its own entrance. The extension would be attached to the existing set-back toilet block and the north gable of the original building. The proposed accommodation would project forward of the main listed building. The ridge line of its duo-pitch roof would run at right-angles to that of the main building, and the general linear trend of the buildings attached to the original building, to its north and south sides.

**Impact**

The essential character of the building, as experienced from the front, described above, would be adversely affected by the proposed development. Not only would the new element project forward of the main original core building, to partially conceal its frontage when approached and experienced from the north, but it would seriously challenge the expression of the symmetrical composition, which is an integral component of its special architectural or historic interest.

The new gable generated, of a decidedly ancillary character, would introduce an incongruous element against the expressive symmetry of the main listed public house. A relatively blank brick gable would be prominently presented to the frontage, to supplant the existing appreciation of the main listed public house, through a distinct lack of sub-servience, respect or positive relationship, in the proposed accommodation. The return brick wall, and apologetic side entrance within the internal corner formed against the toilet block, would be the viewer s impression of this fine, former coaching inn, on their approach from the north.

In 2.14 of the Heritage and Planning (including Design and Access) Statement, there is an implied acknowledgement that the proposal would have more of a material detrimental impact on the listed building and its context and the heritage value of the Idridgehay Conservation Area, than it contends, with less compliance with policy in terms of design quality and appropriateness than asserted:

> *Nevertheless, we appreciate that the details of the design approach, materials and fenestration are of secondary importance to the applicant. The applicant s primary intention is the provision of the accommodation, and should Planning or Conservation Officers believe a different design language would be appropriate, the applicant is willing to commission redesign work and resubmit the application accordingly, as long as such a redesign would result in officer support for the provision of the requested accommodation in the footprint as proposed .*

It is difficult to imagine how any accommodation that projected forward of the main building would avoid harm to its significance, character and appearance, irrespective of the design language. Despite the Authority s obligation to work flexibly with applicants, it would be my advice that the provision of the footprint, as proposed, could not be supported, given its fundamental conflict with the essential character of the designated heritage asset.

**Recommendation**

The case for trying to accommodate all users is noted, but is not guaranteed by this modest extension. The radical recent changes and expansion at the rear of the building, including losses of significance and historic interest internally, have demonstrated a pragmatic approach to changing circumstances or aspirations of the building s previous owners. The current proposals, however, would have an adverse impact on the special architectural or historic interest of this statutory listed heritage asset, which would be harmful to its significance. While I am required to assess the level of harm to the heritage asset, as defined by the NPPF, the Authority s duty to preserve that special interest, under the primary legislation of the 1990 Act, should not be compromised by the case forwarded for the viability of the business, as presented in the application documents, which is not considered to provide clear and convincing justification for the harm described and identified.

The harm to the designated heritage assets would be less than substantial as defined in the current NPPF (February 2019), although the great weight afforded to the conservation of designated heritage assets would require the development to include significant public benefits were it to outweigh the harm to assets of national and local heritage value.

I trust that these comments are suitable for your purposes.

Kind regards

Paul

Paul D Warren

Heritage Consultant

for Amber Valley Borough Council

06 May 2021

**From:** development@ambervalley.gov.uk <development@ambervalley.gov.uk>
**Sent:** 16 March 2021 18:30
**To:** Paul Warren (Economy Transport and Environment) <Paul.Warren@derbyshire.gov.uk>
**Subject:** [OFFICIAL] Planning Consultation - AVA/2021/0280

Dear Sir/Madam

Our Ref: AVA/2021/0280

**Proposal:**
Construction of a modest, single storey extension to The Black Swan Public House and Restaurant to form a snug bar

**Development Type:**
Minor other

**Location:**
The Black Swan Wirksworth Road Idridgehay Belper Derbyshire DE56 2SG

**Applicant:**
Mr Tim Tomlinson
The Black Swan Wirksworth Road Idridgehay Belper Derbyshire DE56 2SG

**Agent:**
Mr Brian Reid
The Black Swan Wirksworth Road Idridgehay Belper Derbyshire DE56 2SG

**Case Officer Details:**
**Name:** Laura Anthony
**Telephone:** 01773 841506
**E Mail:** laura.anthony@ambervalley.gov.uk

I enclose details of this application and would be pleased to receive any comments you may have within the next 21 days.

The Application should be available to view on our website within the next 24 hours.

There is a comments button that you can click on to make comments regarding an application (please see the link below that will take you directly to this planning application) or alternatively you can send a direct email to development@ambervalley.gov.uk

https://www.ambervalley.gov.uk/planning/development-management/view-a-planning-application/?appnumber=AVA-2021-0280

Please let the case officer know if you cannot reply by then.

Sarah Brooks
Planning Manager This email is private. If you are not the intended recipient, please notify the sender by return, destroying the email without disclosing or relying upon it. We may by law have to disclose this email. We monitor both sent and received emails. The attachments are opened at your own risk.

This email or email thread section has been classified CONTROLLED - This email requires controlled access by Council personnel and / or intended recipient(s) only. This email may contain business or personal information. Any personal information you have given us will be processed in accordance with our privacy notices, available at www.derbyshire.gov.uk/privacynotices.

---

We□ve now got coronavirus community testing centres across Derbyshire. One in three with the virus have no symptoms, so get tested to protect your family and those you work with.

---

Think before you print! Save energy and paper. Do you really need to print this email?

Derbyshire County Council works to improve the lives of local people by delivering high quality services. You can find out more about us by visitingwww.derbyshire.gov.uk.
If you want to work for us go to our job pages on www.derbyshire.gov.uk/jobs. You can register for e-mail alerts, download job packs and apply on-line.

---

**Please Note**
This email is confidential, may be legally privileged and may contain personal views that are not the views of Derbyshire County Council. It is intended solely for the addressee. If this email was sent to you in error please notify us by replying to the email. Once you have done this please delete the email and do not disclose, copy, distribute, or rely on it.
Under the Data Protection Act 2018 and the Freedom of Information Act 2000 the contents of this email may be disclosed.
Any personal information you have given us will be processed in accordance with our privacy notices, available at www.derbyshire.gov.uk/privacynotices.

Derbyshire County Council reserves the right to monitor both sent and received emails.

---